

## DRAFT, NOT FOR DISTRIBUTION

### Minutes of the Chinatown Working Group (CWG) Full Group Meeting 5:30pm to 7:30pm, Monday, January 9, 2012 American Legion L.T. Kimlau Post 1291

---

**Voting members present:** American Legion Post 1291 (Gabe Mui); Asian American Arts Centre (Robert Lee); Asian American Legal Defense and Education Fund (Bethany Li); Bowery Alliance of Neighbors (Mitchell Grubler); Chinese Progressive Association (Mae Lee); Chinese Staff and Workers Association (Josephine Lee); Committee Against Anti-Asian Violence (Billie Zhu); Community Board 1 (Michael Levine); Community Board 2 (Antony Wong); Community Board 3 (Gigi Lee, John Leo); CREATE in Chinatown (Amy Chin); Hamilton-Madison House (Thea Goodman); National Mobilization Against Sweatshops (Sophie DeBenedetto); Two Bridges Neighborhood Council (Victor Papa, Wilson Soo).

**Press:** Sing Tao (Bonnie Li); World Journal (Yichen Tu).

**Also present:** Rob Hollander (Lower East Side Residents for Responsible Development); Irving Lee (Property Taxpayers); Alyson Schill (Grow NYC); Susan Yung (Bowery Poetry Club); Frank Yee (Yee Fong Toy Association).

---

Meeting called to order, 4:15pm, Mae Lee and Antony Wong facilitating, Jason Chan translating.

#### 1. Agenda

>>Agenda approved (no objections)

#### 2. Minutes

>>Minutes approved (no objections)

#### 3. CAPZ presentation to Community Board 3. Victor Papa and Michael Levine

Victor Papa: CB3 strongly objected to two of the ten points of our CAPZ agreement. Last week CAPZ met to remove those two items, specifically to exclude the recent East Village/Lower East Side rezoning and SPURA from our plan and boundaries, so we can return to CB3's Land Use Committee.

Michael Levine: In a meeting this morning, the Chair of the Land Use Committee, David McWater, says that he sees no problem with the new plan and its exclusions (see map A). Mr. McWater asked about the development plan, incubators, affordable housing. Michael assured him that those plans have never been taken off the table, but the specifics remain to be formulated. We feel ready to return to the Land Use Committee (Feb.2) and to the Planning Committee of CB1 in March and to CB2 in either February or early March in time to meet the March 31 deadline to submit a request to LMDC to spend the \$150,000 to The Fund for the City of New York has agreed to administer the grant for the consultant.

Josephine Lee: At the last CAPZ we agreed to express our remaining concerns about the excluded areas, in **a letter [see addenda 2 & 3]** to the CB3 Land Use Committee.

Victor Papa: We did draft a letter and mention that "we remain concerned about secondary displacement and affordable housing in the removed areas. We hope that going forward we can work together with the Land Use Committee to address these concerns."

John Leo: It should be sent from the [CWG] co-Chairs.

Rob Hollander: Are there hard data of secondary displacement since the 2008 rezoning?

Victor Papa: Add potential displacement.

Mae Lee: There are many factors for secondary displacement, not just zoning. All factors should be considered.

Bethany Li: AALDEF has found an increase in DoB permits in the excluded areas since 2008, and CAAAV is currently working with tenants at 2 Delancey Street.

Michael Levine: Can we wordsmith?

Gigi Li: The date has to be changed, and "affordable housing" needs a modifier.

Rob Hollander: Does this imply that CWG is going to look at the rezoned area even though we've taken it out of our map.

Mae Lee: Since CB3 has the authority to take on the effort, it makes more sense for us to ask them to do it and invite us to participate.

Bethany Li: CB3's response will be nothing. And they won't invite us.

Mae Lee: Gigi, what do you think?

Gigi Li: Minimal difference.

Josephine Lee: We shouldn't always defer to CB3. We are a legitimate community planning process and we have legitimate concerns. CB3 is not the only planning body. We are one too.

Gigi Li: Remove "In light of this revision" because it looks like we're asking for a quid pro quo.

Rob Hollander: CB3 cannot ignore secondary displacement. They can't ignore a whole community. Let's put the ball in their court. If they don't do anything, then we can always go back to them with the data. Not everything needs to be resolved in this one letter.

Gigi Li: Land Use will consider secondary displacement. McWater himself is interested in how it plays out. It can be tweaked at the meeting.

Rob Hollander: What do you object to in the last two lines.

Josephine Lee: We are not an arm of McWater and should be explicit about what we are want, and we want to work with you.

Michael Levine: Do the members of the Land Use Committee know about this letter. Water has to be prepared. Do we need a cover letter?

Mae Lee: Follow-up is key. Someone has to talk to the members.

Gigi Li: How about "under the guidance of the Land Use Committee" – I don't like the word "under" -- or "with the leadership of Land Use"

Bethany Li: Prefer "in collaboration with Land Use..."

Victor Papa: Prefer "in collaboration."

Rob Hollander: I would like Gigi to decide this.

Mitchell Grubler: The modifier of "affordable housing" should be "loss." And it should name not "CAPZ" but "CWG."

Michael Levine: the CAPZ chairs will sign it on behalf of CWG. Also there should be a broad presence at the next meeting to show that there is wide interest in the plan.

[Michael has to leave; he excuses himself.]

Victor Papa: Let Gigi decide the language.

Gigi Li: "with the guidance of CB3."

**>>Consensus: "with the guidance of the CB3 Land Use Committee."**

Irving Lee: Is CWG under the guidance of CB3 by law?

Victor Papa: It is a word intended to evoke trust and confidence.

Mae Lee: Straw poll: all agree.

**>>Letter is approved by acclaim (unanimous) [see addendum 4].**

Rob Hollander: **The map** still includes the EB-Essex-Grand St. And the coops to the ER.

Victor Papa: CB3 should take object publicly to Dominic's letter. Serious issue.

Rob Hollander: if you don't want to do anything there, why invite trouble.

Josephine Lee: There are other voices in the Grand Street coops.

Rob Hollander: You won't get anything there.

Victor Papa: We can't do anything there for every political reason. Take it out..

Mae Lee: We have to get it right.

Bethany Li & Gigi Li: Can we do this at the Land Use meeting?

Rob Hollander: If we are ready to take it out, take it out. There's an issue of good faith.

They need to know exactly what we intend. What about Henry and Madison? That's Shtiebl Row and Educational Alliance and Henry Street Settlement

Thea Goodman: It's all private. What can you do in that area?

Gigi Li: There are 22 members of Land Use, 8 from Grand and 3 affiliated.

Mitchell Grubler: The line should exclude only East Broadway.

Mae Lee: Just take out all the Grand Street coops.

Victor Papa: Nothing stops us or the consultant looking at anything. But for the purpose of this letter, we should take it out south to East Broadway.

Rob Hollander: How are you going to justify Henry and Madison?

Victor Papa: You are responding to the CB Chair's letter.

Rob Hollander: No. I am responding to our legitimacy What's on Madison?

Gigi Li: We shouldn't take out more. It opens the door to them asking more. That's residential there too. I know people who live there. The goodwill gesture is SPURA, the rezoning and to East Braodway is enough.

Victor Papa: East Broadway-Essex Street-Delancey to the FDR.

Thea Goodman: Henry Street is Chinatown.

**>>All agree on the new boundaries: East Broadway-Essex Street-Delancey, the coops to the FDR.**

Rob Hollander: What about the FAR numbers? Weren't we going to replace numbers with "the most protective FAR possible."

Bethany Li: We agreed not to replace but to add that language.

Victor Papa: McWater is okay with the numbers.

Rob Hollander: Withdrawn.

**Implementation Task Force, Mae Lee presenting (Kathleen Webster is away)**

Mae: Since the last CWG meeting, we went to CB1 and CB2 to discuss our action plans. The meetings went pretty well. They were very supportive. The members are educators, social workers etc. and said they would help individually. They were concerned about the education policies that are state-wide and are beyond CWG's power. Also spoke to the Glenn MacAfee of the Chinatown Y. They are interested in hosting a parent resource center although there are few funds or staff available with all the budget cuts. But they are interested in knowing more. We are yet to set up meetings with Sheldon Silver and Daniel Squadron. They are friends of CWG, and we need state support. We will inform members of the meeting schedule.

### **Community announcements**

Grow NYC: provides education for adults and children about recycling, building assessments, tenant trainings for buildings, seminars for superintendents, recycling events, clothing exchanges, compost locations. [grownyc.org/oroe](http://grownyc.org/oroe), 212-788-7964

Rob Hollander: Cultural and Historical Preservation Team will present Thursday on landmarking. Come learn more about our plan.

John Leo: Apply for the Community Board. The deadline is January 13. Get the application online at [CB3manhattan.org](http://CB3manhattan.org) or at the Borough President's website.

Robert Lee: AAAC is having its Folk Arts Festival with Children's Museum of the Arts on Charlton Street between Varick & Church Streets. It is a remarkable and huge museum. Presenting folk artists. Usually a museum, but for this festival you can go there anytime. Children can make pots, art etc. January 28, Sat 10:30-6pm . AAAC will be there 1-6pm. Children's Museum of the Arts.

There was a demonstration about Danny Chen. Occupy Wall Street participated. OWS is trying to help, and along with the Chinatown community also wants to help Gillibrand's investigation on military hazing. We also want an investigation into military suicides as well. Please support the OWS effort to work with immigrant and Chinatown organizations.

Mae Lee: Organization of Chinese Americans, New York Chapter, has been holding press conferences and meeting with the army. Wellington Chen has been participating with those meetings in Washington, D.C. Contact Liz Young or Jerry Cheng who are members of OCA.

Meeting adjourned, 7:15pm.

Respectfully submitted,  
Rob Hollander, Secretary